

Fifth Senedd Legacy Report

March 2021



The Welsh Parliament is the democratically elected body that represents the interests of Wales and its people. Commonly known as the Senedd, it makes laws for Wales, agrees Welsh taxes and holds the Welsh Government to account.

An electronic copy of this document can be found on the Welsh Parliament website: www.senedd.wales/SeneddCWLC

Copies of this document can also be obtained in accessible formats including Braille, large print, audio or hard copy from:

Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee
Welsh Parliament
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1SN

Tel: **0300 200 6565**

Email: **SeneddCWLC@senedd.wales**

Twitter: **[@SeneddCWLC](https://twitter.com/SeneddCWLC)**

© Senedd Commission Copyright 2021

The text of this document may be reproduced free of charge in any format or medium providing that it is reproduced accurately and not used in a misleading or derogatory context. The material must be acknowledged as copyright of the Senedd Commission and the title of the document specified.

Fifth Senedd Legacy Report

March 2021



About the Committee

The Committee was established on 28 June 2016. Its remit can be found at:
www.senedd.wales/SeneddCWLC

Committee Chair:



Bethan Sayed MS
Plaid Cymru

Current Committee membership:



Mick Antoniw MS
Welsh Labour



John Griffiths MS
Welsh Labour



Carwyn Jones MS
Welsh Labour



Helen Mary Jones MS
Plaid Cymru



David Melding MS
Welsh Conservatives

Suggested areas of scrutiny for the Sixth Senedd

Engagement

The successor committee should consider holding more formal committee meetings virtually and/or mainstreaming hybrid meetings. This would allow for greater participation from a wider range of stakeholders.

The Sixth Senedd committee should continue to innovate in its approach to engaging with the public directly to inform the work of the committee.

The successor committee should work with the Youth Parliament on scrutiny/inquiries, as well as canvassing it to hear their priorities for the next work programme.

Arts

The long term funding and delivery of music education, given its importance in nurturing the next generation of artists.

The Fifth Senedd committee explored access to culture in terms of tackling poverty and social exclusion. More can be done in future to explore access to culture from ethnically diverse backgrounds and the barriers to entry which may exist for some people.

Creative industries

The long-term challenges to the publishing industry and the Welsh Government's approach to providing financial support for literary development and publishing in both the Welsh and English languages.

The delivery of Creative Wales' programme of activity, in particular, the Welsh Government's screen strategy and commitments to addressing skills shortages in the screen industry.

The arrangements for touring artists in the EU following the UK's withdrawal from the European Union have been criticised by artists. The next committee should inquire about the financial and social implications for musicians and artists wishing to share their work in the EU.

The successor committee should monitor the Welsh Government's development and delivery of a music Action Plan.

Heritage

Progress on the delivery of the National Contemporary Art Gallery for Wales and the Sports Museum.

The effect of the loss of commercial income for heritage organisations such as National Museum Wales and CADW as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

The delivery of the Welsh Government's response to the Committee's recommendations in the report on who should be remembered in public spaces.

The National Library's implementation of the recommendations of the recent Welsh Government tailored review.

Communications

The successor committee should ensure the Welsh Government responds to the report on the devolution of broadcasting and monitors the delivery of any commitments made in the response.

Continuing the scrutiny of public service broadcasters to ensure they deliver their commitments to increase the representation of the richness of Welsh communities in network output. A successor Committee should take evidence from Channel 4 and Channel 5 to explore their output for Welsh audiences and production in Wales.

An assessment of the extent to which public service broadcasting reporting on the COVID-19 pandemic at a UK level was accurate and its effect on raising awareness of devolved decision-making.

Looking at how Ofcom represents Welsh interests in discussions on broadcasting at a UK level.

The Welsh language

The inquiry into Welsh in a digital world, started by the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee in the Fifth Senedd should be continued by a successor Committee.

During the Fifth Senedd, the Committee has regularly sought to scrutinise the delivery of Welsh language policy and funding via the Minister with responsibility for the Welsh Language in his/her title. However, at various points, issues raised by Members have not been addressed satisfactorily by the Minister with policy oversight for the Welsh language. Too often, Member questions have been

directed to other Ministerial portfolios, such as the Minister for Education. The next committee should ensure that the Welsh Government is held accountable for cross cutting issues, such as the Welsh language.

It is important therefore that the relevant Welsh Government Minister is answerable for delivering on the Cymraeg 2050 targets that fall within his/her area of responsibility.

In the event that there is no Welsh Government Minister with responsibility for the Welsh language, the successor Committee should explore opportunities in the Sixth Senedd to hold joint-scrutiny sessions/inquiries with other committees to monitor progress on Cymraeg 2050 targets. For example, a joint-session with the committee with responsibility for education, to monitor targets to increase the number of Welsh-medium teachers and learners.

The long term effect of the COVID-19 pandemic

The ways in which heritage, the arts and cultural organisations are seeking to recover their losses or repurpose their activity as a result of the pandemic and the extent to which reducing dependence on public subsidy is still a viable approach.

The role that culture can play in Wales' economic and social recovery from the pandemic.

The next committee should ensure that national organisations with responsibility for promoting the Welsh language through participatory events, such as the Urdd, the Royal Welsh and the Eisteddfod are proactively supported in their work following severe economic losses due to the pandemic.

The next committee should inquire about the impact on the community use of the Welsh language as a result of the pandemic

Future committee remit

Members of the Sixth Senedd should convene a committee to scrutinise culture, the Welsh language and communications which would fulfil a valuable role in focussing on:

- the needs of Welsh local media and broadcasting;
- the delivery of the Welsh Government's ambition for increasing the number of Welsh speakers; and

- the work to expand access to heritage, the arts and creative industries and ensure the sector is supported following the losses from the pandemic.

The committee should seek opportunities to carry out joint scrutiny/inquiries with other committees. For instance, with the committee scrutinising the economy to look at creative industries.

Introduction

The aim of this report is not to summarise the entirety of the work done by the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee in the Fifth Senedd. Rather, it highlights some of the outcomes of the inquiries, scrutiny of policy and legislation and stakeholder engagement in the hope of reflecting areas where the Committee has had the most influence. Often the cumulative impact of sustained scrutiny in one area of government activity has proved to be effective and in some cases a single report or committee session was followed by the desired policy change or funding commitment.

It is not possible, at this point, to evaluate the longer term impact of the Committee's work. This report highlights the more immediate impact of some of the committee's work.

For each area of the remit, there are suggestions for further work which the next Senedd Committee with these responsibilities might wish to undertake. Again, this is not a complete summary of work by the Committee, this is provided in the Annex to this report.

The Chair, and Members, would like to thank witnesses and stakeholders for their contribution to the work of the committee.

Helen Mary Jones MS chaired the Committee during Bethan Sayed MS' maternity leave, our thanks to both for their leadership and commitment to raising the profile of the issues within this remit.

Remit

1. The Committee has carried out work on:

- creative industries, including live music, film and television productions;
- heritage, museums and archives;
- the arts;
- journalism and broadcasting; and
- Welsh language, including Welsh language regulations, education and promotion.

2. During the Fifth Senedd the scrutiny work of the Committee covered the following cabinet portfolios in the Welsh Government:

- the Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism;
- the Minister for the Welsh Language and Lifelong Learning; later titled Minister for International Relations and the Welsh Language; later titled the Minister for Mental Health, Wellbeing and the Welsh Language;
- the Minister for Economy, Transport and North Wales;
- the Deputy Minister and Chief Whip; and
- the Minister for Education.

1. Engagement

3. From the beginning, the Committee wanted its programme of work to be informed by the public. The committee asked the people of Wales directly to decide the subject of a future inquiry. Ideas were invited through Facebook, Twitter and by e-mail, and an event at the National Eisteddfod. Over 2,600 responded to this first poll.

4. The suggested topics included:

- how the ambition of achieving a million Welsh speakers can be achieved;
- concern at the continuing decline of local media and local news journalism;
- lack of portrayal of Wales on UK broadcast networks;
- the role of Radio in Wales; and
- the remit, funding and accountability of S4C.

5. The Committee decided it would conduct an [inquiry into the Welsh language](#) and the remaining suggestions (not listed above) were then put to a second poll for the public to vote upon. Young people in youth groups and schools, and adults through community groups, businesses and organisations took part in Outreach workshops and presentations where they completed the poll. Visitors to the [Senedd in Cardiff Bay](#) were also informed and encouraged to take part.

6. Nearly 2,500 people participated in the second poll. Forty-four per cent voted for 'Teaching of Welsh history, culture and heritage in schools'.

7. The Clerk of the Committee held a workshop with the Youth Parliament to ascertain their priorities for committee work. Their comments were fed into the terms of reference for the inquiry into Welsh in a digital world.

8. The Chair gave evidence to the UK Government's [Cairncross Review](#) on a sustainable future for journalism.

Committee on location

9. Recognising that the majority of the people the Committee would like to engage with are not always able to attend formal meetings in the Senedd building, the Committee held formal meetings and stakeholder engagement sessions in places including St Fagan’s museum, Aberystwyth Arts Centre, Tramshed Cardiff, and Tŷ Pawb in Wrexham. The Committee heard first hand from policy makers and the national broadcaster in Bilbao about their efforts to increase the number of Basque speakers as part of the inquiry into supporting and promoting the Welsh language.

Ways of working

10. All of those who responded to the consultation exercise for this report were in favour of holding more virtual committee sessions. Stakeholders felt that virtual sessions were easier for participants and allowed a wider range of people to engage with the work of the committee. For instance, Cymdeithas yr Iaith said:

“We commend the Committee for effectively managing the challenges posed by COVID-19; in particular, the Committee's use of technology has been highly successful, and the Committee's work has consequently been made more accessible. When the pandemic has passed, the Committee should continue to allow people to present evidence virtually, as requiring people to travel to the Senedd to give evidence to the Committee is not accessible, and it also leads to geographical bias in the evidence gathered by the Committee.”¹

11. Disability Can Do called for the Committee to ensure far more engagement with underrepresented groups in future. Allan Herbert said:

“It is essential that the committee takes it upon itself to ensure that the involvement of citizens and communities are reflected in the design and implementation of public resources as regards arts and culture. It would be beneficial to have a process of consistent citizen representation within the mechanics of the committee and that this process is transparent and publicly available.”²

¹ Cymdeithas yr Iaith written response

² Disability Can Do written response

Suggested ways of working in the Sixth Senedd:

The successor committee should consider holding more formal committee meetings virtually and/or mainstreaming hybrid meetings. This would allow for greater participation from a wider range of stakeholders.

The Sixth Senedd committee should continue to innovate in its approach to engaging with the public directly to inform the work of the committee.

The successor committee should work with the Youth Parliament on scrutiny/inquiries, as well as canvassing it to hear their priorities for the next work programme.

2. Arts

12. One of the areas that the Committee looked at is the need to democratise access to the arts. The inquiry into using [culture to tackle poverty and social exclusion](#) looked at the Welsh Government’s [Fusion](#) programme and also more widely at the ways in which access for all is promoted by the Arts Council for Wales in their funding arrangements and how our flagship cultural bodies are doing outreach work.

13. Following the recommendations in this report, all those in receipt of funding from the Arts Council for Wales will be required to set out their objectives for tackling poverty in their strategic plans and the Welsh Government committed to increase the funding for Fusion programme, alongside a wholesale review of the programme against its original objectives. The Government said:

“The revised Fusion budget for 2021-22 of £430k will include the planned expansion of the coordinators network, independent evaluation and digital projects as part of the commitment to the CWLC review “count me in” in to the Fusion programme.”³

14. The Committee also looked at the opportunities to learn and play music in schools. The inquiry into [funding for and access to music education](#) found that the provision of music teaching is variable across Wales and recommended that ‘the Welsh Government should transfer responsibility for the delivery of music services to an arms-length, national body with a distinct regional delivery mechanism and footprint.’⁴

15. In response, the Welsh Government commissioned a feasibility study. Ultimately, the Minister for Education decided against establishing a new body, saying:

“There is a risk that governance arrangements will receive too much attention at the expense of more fundamental considerations as to the nature of the services that should be provided and how quality and effectiveness can be assured at the point of delivery.”⁵

³ Welsh Government Draft Budget 2021-22 Briefing paper

⁴ [Hitting the Right Note: inquiry into funding for and access to music education](#)

⁵ [Music Services Feasibility Study](#)

16. The Committee welcomed the substantial increase in funding for music education, with the Welsh Government committing £1.5m per year from 2018-19. However, the Committee feel that the delivery of music education would benefit from a comprehensive strategy and a long term funding plan and is an area which would benefit from further scrutiny.

Suggested areas of scrutiny for the Sixth Senedd:

The long term funding and delivery of music education, given its importance in nurturing the next generation of artists.

The Fifth Senedd committee explored access to culture in terms of tackling poverty and social exclusion. More can be done in future to explore access to culture from ethnically diverse backgrounds and the barriers to entry which may exist for some people.

3. Creative industries

17. This Committee heard from stakeholders that [Creative Wales](#) – the arm’s length body responsible for ‘driving growth across the creative industries’ - hit the ground running with their timely response to delivering support for those affected by the COVID-19 lockdown. The scrutiny of delivery of their ambitious programme of activities will be for the relevant committee in the Sixth Senedd.

18. The inquiry into [film and major television productions](#) found that growth in the Welsh screen industries outstripped that of the rest of the UK over the last decade. The sector is booming but the inquiry found it was unclear what role the Welsh Government has played in this success. Their flagship fund, the Media Investment Budget, had failed to deliver expected returns and stakeholders complained of a potential skills shortage. The Committee called on the Welsh Government to draw up a strategy which would take the sector to the next level.

19. In response, the Welsh Government is drawing up a screen strategy which prioritises skills and supply chain development and the promotion of Welsh culture and talent. The Government also committed to ‘Develop a framework of specialist support providers to deliver timely and responsive training to fill gaps.’⁶

20. Unfortunately the Committee did not have time to look at the promotion and support for literature beyond the review it carried out into the [findings on the Independent Review of Support for Publishing and Literature in Wales](#).

Music

21. The Committee looked at the challenges facing the [live music](#) sector in 2020. The Committee was due to recommend a funding pot to protect at risk grass roots venues in the same report, but, fortunately, this was pre-empted by the Welsh Government. Likewise, a recommendation on carrying out a venue mapping exercise was pre-empted by the Welsh Government, which has committed to repeat the exercise and extend it to include rehearsal and recording spaces. Additionally, in response to the recommendation to develop a music strategy the Welsh Government said:

“Creative Wales will be developing a pan-Wales “Action plan” rather than “Strategy” for the Commercial Music Industry in Wales. It will reflect the need for both short term actions required to assist the sector

⁶ [Welsh Government response to the report on film and television](#)

to recover from the COVID-19 pandemic and longer term plans for developing the sector for a sustainable future, in a global market.”⁷

22. The inquiry into the live music sector undoubtedly raised the profile of the challenges facing the industry, coincidentally, just before the lockdown resulted in huge losses. By agreeing to establish a fund for supporting grass roots venues the Welsh Government has recognised that these venues are important incubators for future talent and cultural assets which should be supported. Previously, live music venues were too ‘commercial’ to qualify for assistance from the Arts Council for Wales and not large enough to get assistance from Business Wales. The Committee’s work in this area has successfully drawn government attention to the value of grassroots venues.

23. Creative Industries are a vital growth area for the Welsh economy. For instance, the Committee heard from Tim Davie, BBC Director General, that:

”It is a growth area; it was growing four times the speed of the wider economy going into COVID. We need Wales to capture its fair share, at minimum, of that growth coming out, and there are really good signs that we can make that happen.”⁸

24. In order to capitalise on the opportunities for growth in creative industries and to raise the profile of the arts, culture and heritage, this portfolio would be better served with a Ministerial, not a Deputy Ministerial post.

Suggested areas of scrutiny for the Sixth Senedd:

The long-term challenges to the publishing industry and the Welsh Government’s approach to providing financial support for literary development and publishing in both the Welsh and English languages.

The delivery of Creative Wales’ programme of activity, in particular, the Welsh Government’s screen strategy and commitments to addressing skills shortages in the screen industry.

The arrangements for touring artists in the EU following the UK’s withdrawal from the European Union have been criticised by artists. The next committee

⁷ [Welsh Government response to the report on the live music industry](#)

⁸ CWLC committee 4 March 2021, para 14

should inquire about the financial and social implications for musicians and artists wishing to share their work in the EU.

The successor committee should monitor the Welsh Government's development and delivery of a music Action Plan.

4. Heritage

25. The Committee completed inquiries into the historic environment, the teaching of Welsh history in the new curriculum and the effect of the pandemic on heritage, museums and archives.

26. As well as inquiries, the Committee carried out annual scrutiny sessions with the relevant Government sponsored bodies. Following these sessions, the Committee repeatedly called for increased capital investment in the National Library for Wales and the National Museum Wales. For instance, in November 2019 the Committee heard from David Anderson, the Director of the National Museum Wales, that ‘backlog maintenance and preventative maintenance is probably now somewhere around about £50 million’.⁹

27. The Committee also called for increased funding for the National Library to mitigate what the FDA union described as ‘over a decade of cuts to grant in aid’¹⁰ and to reassure staff there would be no redundancies.

28. In February 2021 the Welsh Government announced additional funding of £6.2m over two years for the National Library of Wales and for National Museum Wales, saying the funding will ‘mitigate against job losses whilst also supporting both organisations with operational costs.’¹¹

29. In December 2018 the Committee was made aware that the business case for a Heritage Lottery Fund grant of £5m to establish a National Broadcast Archive for Wales was at risk. Following the Committee’s intervention to bring the interested parties together at the earliest opportunity the outstanding issues were resolved. The Welsh Government committed funding of £1m to the National Library for Wales and the Heritage Lottery Fund grant was secured.

Suggested areas of scrutiny for the Sixth Senedd:

Progress on the delivery of the National Contemporary Art Gallery for Wales and the Sports Museum.

⁹ CWLC committee 14 November 2019, para 10

¹⁰ FDA correspondence

¹¹ [Welsh Government statement](#)

The effect of the loss of commercial income for heritage organisations such as National Museum Wales and CADW as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

The delivery of the Welsh Government's response to the Committee's recommendations in the report on who should be remembered in public spaces.

The National Library's implementation of the recommendations of the recent Welsh Government tailored review.

5. Communications

30. For the first time the issues affecting journalism, local media and broadcasting were looked at in depth by a Senedd committee.

31. The Committee carried out an inquiry into [news journalism](#) in 2018 which found that the impact in Wales from the decline in traditional print newspapers has had a greater impact because the Welsh media is smaller and less diverse than other parts of the UK. The report recommended that the Welsh Government should formally recognise that supporting public interest journalism in Wales is a strategic priority and fundamental to democracy in Wales.

32. Following this inquiry, the Welsh Government provided £100,000 annually to support providers in hyper-local news.

33. In December 2020, when pressed on the continued need to support English language journalism, the Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism said he hoped to ‘be able to bring forward a scheme that could offer arm’s-length support.’¹² This was confirmed in January 2021 when he said:

“those developments are ongoing, but the model will be similar to the Welsh language model, with collaboration with the Welsh Books Council, who are of course now part of Creative Wales.”¹³

34. The Fifth Senedd saw a consistent approach to annual scrutiny of public service broadcasters in Wales for the first time. During these sessions the Committee has sought to alert decision-makers at a UK level to the fact that Wales is not as well represented as the rest of the UK.

35. For instance, in the report on [initial views on broadcasting](#) in 2017 the Committee recommended that the BBC should:

“provide an additional £30 million annually for English language drama and broadcasting about Wales”, which ‘would potentially allow for a doubling of the output and for BBC Wales to produce quality programmes that have a better chance of earning a place on the BBC

¹² [Plenary debate 2 December 2020](#)

¹³ CWLC committee 14 January 2021, para 94

network'.¹⁴ The BBC has since committed to investing an additional £8.5 million per year in English language programming for Wales.¹⁵

36. In the same report, the Committee recommended that ITV 'adopts a more pro-active approach to developing programmes for broadcast on the ITV network including setting specific goals for developing network output from Wales, which reflects life in Wales'.¹⁶

37. The Committee's report on the future of S4C pre-empted and informed the independent review of S4C, presented to the UK Government's Department for Culture, Media and Sport ('DCMS') in 2017. The Committee said that cuts in funding for Welsh language broadcaster S4C 'have been both severe and disproportionate' and are having 'a lasting and severe impact on its ability to provide its service'.¹⁷

38. The DCMS accepted all of the recommendations of the independent review, including the need to update S4C's public service remit to 'include digital and online services and remove the current geographical broadcasting restrictions. [To] allow S4C to broaden its reach and offer its content on a range of new platforms in the UK and beyond'.¹⁸

39. In November 2020 the UK Government formally began the process to agree the level of the licence fee from 2022. This is the first time that the licence fee will also cover all of the public funding provided to S4C. The importance of the licence fee debate and the challenges facing Welsh language content providers are explored in the Committee report on the devolution of broadcasting. One of the recommendations in the report, following much discussion on the viability of future regulatory and funding models, is that the UK Government should devolve powers over S4C and other public service Welsh language broadcasting matters to Wales.

40. The report also called for the Welsh Government to have an enhanced role in setting the terms of the next Channel 3 licence in Wales, which should include a requirement to produce a greater proportion of network content in Wales.

¹⁴ The Big Picture: The Committee's initial views about broadcasting in Wales

¹⁵ Ibid

¹⁶ The Big Picture: The Committee's initial views about broadcasting in Wales, February 2017

¹⁷ Outside the box: The future of S4C, August 2017

¹⁸ UK Government response to the S4C Independent Review: building an S4C for the Future

41. The inquiry into radio in 2018 found that the deregulation of commercial radio broadcasting happened in a way which did not benefit Welsh audiences. The Committee recommended the UK Government should introduce a regulatory requirement for commercial radio stations in Wales to report on distinctly Welsh news, as well as local and UK news as part of its reform of commercial radio. It also called for the BBC to explore options to enable a Wales opt-out on network radio services and to set itself more stretching targets for UK network radio content from Wales.¹⁹

42. The same report looked at the challenges facing community radio and recommended that the Welsh Government consider introducing a new fund to support the sector, taking account of any synergies between community radio and other hyperlocal news providers. In looking at the effect of the pandemic on local media the Committee heard of the vital role community radio played in providing timely and accurate information about lockdown regulations.

43. During the Fifth Senedd, the Committee wrote to Ofcom to:

- Say that the BBC's request to amend the Operating Licence to remove the 100% speech quota at breakfast time was a dilution of Welsh-specific content for Welsh audiences;
- to argue against Ofcom's proposal to merge the whole of Wales into a single 'approved area' for the sake of determining the proportion of 'locally-made' commercial radio hours which stations are required to produce to enable them to meet their licence obligations;
- to voice support for a Wales news opt-out for BBC Radio 1 and Radio 2;

44. Reflecting on the way these issues were dealt with at a UK level, the next Committee may choose to look at how Wales' needs are being advocated for when decisions on broadcasting regulations are being discussed.

Suggested areas of scrutiny for the Sixth Senedd:

The successor committee should ensure the Welsh Government responds to the report on the devolution of broadcasting and monitors the delivery of any commitments made in the response.

¹⁹ Tuning in: Inquiry into radio in Wales, December 2018

<https://senedd.wales/laid%20documents/cr-ld11993/cr-ld11993-e.pdf>

Continuing the scrutiny of public service broadcasters to ensure they deliver their commitments to increase the representation of the richness of Welsh communities in network output. A successor Committee should take evidence from Channel 4 and Channel 5 to explore their output for Welsh audiences and production in Wales.

An assessment of the extent to which public service broadcasting reporting on the COVID-19 pandemic at a UK level was accurate and its effect on raising awareness of devolved decision-making.

Look at how Ofcom represents Welsh interests in discussions on broadcasting at a UK level.

6. Welsh language

45. The Committee carried out two inquiries on issues relating to the Welsh language. The first, looked at the Welsh Government's Welsh language strategy which aimed to create one million Welsh speakers by 2050, that is, to almost double the number of Welsh speakers in Wales in just over a generation.

46. The Committee's main concerns during the inquiry were the lack of detail in the strategy about how this will be achieved, the lack of resources; reliance in the strategy on the maintained education sector and that Local Authorities had not done enough to stimulate demand for increased Welsh medium provision in public services.

47. In response to the Committee's recommendations, the Welsh Government agreed to include targets about the number of additional teachers needed to teach through the medium of Welsh. Since the report was published, progress on meeting these targets has fallen well below what is needed. The Minister for Mental Health, Wellbeing and the Welsh Language told the Committee in February 2021:

"There has been a great deal of effort made, but of course we are disappointed that we haven't reached that target and we are highly aware that we need to do a lot more work."²⁰

48. The Sixth Senedd committee with responsibility for the Welsh language should assess progress against targets in the Cymraeg 2050 strategy, prioritising the targets for Welsh medium teachers and education.

49. The second inquiry looked at how the Welsh Government is supporting and promoting the Welsh language, spurred on by the Government's White Paper proposals for a new Welsh Language Bill in August 2017.

50. The Committee heard evidence that the current Welsh language standards framework is complex and bureaucratic, and that the complaints system is considered excessively long and burdensome. However, the Committee also heard that the current framework provides certainty for organisations, as well as strong rights for Welsh speakers. The Committee concluded that the focus on legislation had deflected attention and resources away from the "softer" elements of language planning, specifically promotion of the language. Lack of clarity in

²⁰ CWLC Committee, 25 February 2021, para 21

roles and responsibility between the Welsh Government and the Welsh Language Commissioner was also a concern.

51. As a result of the recommendations in the report, the Welsh Government and Welsh Language Commissioner agreed a Memorandum of Understanding to clarify their relevant functions. The process for addressing complaints has also been streamlined and sped up. A new multi-disciplinary team called Prosiect 2050 has been established in Government to drive planning, promotion and behaviour change.

52. The Welsh Government withdrew the White Paper proposals, saying it had noted:

“the evidence received by the Committee during this review. When preparing standards in future we will consider how they can be streamlined and prepared in a way which reduces bureaucracy for the bodies which comply with them, while ensuring that they continue to bestow clear rights on service users.”²¹

53. There are many actors involved in supporting and promoting the language in Wales. One such actor is the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol (‘CCC’). The CCC leads on the development of Welsh-medium and bilingual education and training in the post-compulsory sector in Wales. This includes developing and improving Welsh-medium courses, and increasing the number of bilingual staff in the post-16 sector. The Committee heard, as part of its recent scrutiny of the Welsh Government’s Draft Budget 2021-22, that the sector needs ‘suitable resources’²² in order to deliver the ambitions in the Action Plan agreed in 2018.

54. The CCC wrote to the Committee Chair in January, noting that it anticipated a need for the Welsh Government to invest £800,000 for 2021-22, increasing to £1.4m in 2022-23, £2.5m in 2023-24 and £3.2m in 2024-25 in order for it to ensure a significant increase in Welsh-medium provision.

55. As a result of the Committee’s scrutiny, and Member scrutiny in Senedd Plenary sessions, the Welsh Government’s Final Budget 2021-22 included an additional £800,000 of funding for the CCC.

²¹ [Welsh Government response to the report on supporting and promoting the Welsh language](#)

²² Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol correspondence

- 56.** In 2019, following the results of the Committee’s public poll, in which 40 per cent of respondents stated they wanted the Committee to look into the teaching of Welsh history, the Committee undertook a full inquiry into the issue.
- 57.** With proposals for wide ranging changes to the school curriculum, the Committee found a high degree of concern from teachers, history societies, pupils and academics, that children do not know the story of their community or country and that often children commented that they learnt more Welsh history in a Welsh language lesson than from their history teacher. These concerns were growing as a result of the planned changes to the curriculum.
- 58.** In line with the recommendation in the report on teaching of Welsh history, Estyn will carry out a review of the current teaching of Welsh history in schools. This review will provide evidence of the extent to which schools are currently meeting the requirements of the GCSE, AS and A level specifications on teaching Welsh content.
- 59.** The Committee was disappointed that the Welsh Government rejected the recommendation to ‘include guidance which sets out a common body of knowledge for all pupils studying history’²³ in the new curriculum.
- 60.** The Committee were in the initial stages of a new inquiry into Welsh in a digital world in 2020. The inquiry aimed to evaluate the aims and objectives of the Welsh language technology action plan and how the Welsh Government is working with other partners and technology companies to influence the tech sector. However, the work was put on hold when the COVID-19 pandemic shifted the Committee’s priorities.

Suggested areas of scrutiny for the Sixth Senedd

The inquiry into Welsh in a digital world, started by the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee in the Fifth Senedd should be continued by a successor Committee.

During the Fifth Senedd, the Committee has regularly sought to scrutinise the delivery of Welsh language policy and funding via the Minister with responsibility for the Welsh Language in his/her title. However, at various points, issues raised by Members have not been addressed satisfactorily by the Minister with policy oversight for the Welsh language. Too often, Member questions have been directed to other Ministerial portfolios, such as the Minister for Education.

²³ Report on Teaching of Welsh History

The next committee should ensure that the Welsh Government is held accountable for cross cutting issues, such as the Welsh language.

It is important therefore that the relevant Welsh Government Minister is answerable for delivering on the Cymraeg 2050 targets that fall within his/her area of responsibility.

In the event that there is no Welsh Government Minister with responsibility for the Welsh language, the successor Committee should explore opportunities in the Sixth Senedd to hold joint-scrutiny sessions/inquiries with other committees to monitor progress on Cymraeg 2050 targets. For example, a joint-session with the committee with responsibility for education, to monitor targets to increase the number of Welsh-medium teachers and learners.

7. The effect of the COVID-19 pandemic

61. Due to the impact of the pandemic, the work of the Committee was paused in March, before restarting virtually in May 2020. The effect on individuals and organisations was sudden and significant. The inability to raise commercial revenue and the loss of opportunities to come together and enjoy cultural activities had a severe impact on all committee stakeholders. The long term financial and social effects of the pandemic are a topic for scrutiny in the next Senedd.

62. The Committee held a series of short inquiries into the effect of the pandemic on all areas of its remit, publishing six reports between June and December 2020. Due to the pressure of work on the Health and Social Care Committee, this committee also looked at sport.

63. There were common themes including:

- the sudden and dramatic loss of income felt by organisations which had to close;
- the anxiety from not knowing when venues could reopen again; and
- the fact that the majority of those who work in the arts and creative industries are freelancers and fell through the gaps of employment support from the UK Government.

64. The majority of organisations under the Committee’s remit exist for the purpose of participatory activities, including live music venues, museums, Welsh language promotion and dance recitals. All were forced to pause their work for over a year.

65. Cultural organisations have been encouraged by the Welsh Government to reduce reliance on public subsidy in order to increase their resilience as funding from the Welsh Government and National Lottery has fallen by over 10 per cent in the last decade.²⁴ The Committee heard from the Chief Executive of the Arts Council for Wales, Nick Capaldi, that ‘Ironically, those organisations that are least dependent on public funding have been the ones hardest hit’.²⁵

²⁴ [Building resilience: inquiry into non-public funding of the arts](#)

²⁵ [Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the arts](#)

66. National organisations which are beacons of good practice in promoting and increasing Welsh language use and learning - such as the Urdd and the National Eisteddfod - are facing significant financial challenges. The Committee recommended that short-term reprioritisation of funds, for instance from The National Centre for Learning Welsh to the central COVID fund, do not result in long term changes to allocations. Such measures could detract from achieving the goal of a million Welsh-speakers by 2050.²⁶

67. The COVID-19 inquiries found:

- The pandemic prompted a move to digital engagement and delivery. For this to be successful long term it requires increased spending on training and access to fast, reliable broadband infrastructure;
- The need to re-evaluate funding models which encourage organisations to reduce reliance on public subsidies;
- The freelance workers in the cultural sector have consistently fallen through the gaps of UK Government employment support, and support from the Welsh Government has not been able to meet demand;
- The need to evaluate the provision of financial support to individuals and organisations provided during the lockdown; and
- The need to evaluate the long term impact of the lockdown on heritage, museums, archives, performance venues, Welsh language festivals and participation in sports.

Suggested areas of scrutiny in the Sixth Senedd:

The ways in which heritage, the arts and cultural organisations are seeking to recover their losses or repurpose their activity as a result of the pandemic and the extent to which reducing dependence on public subsidy is still a viable approach.

The role that culture can play in Wales' economic and social recovery from the pandemic.

The next committee should ensure that national organisations with responsibility for promoting the Welsh language through participatory events,

²⁶ [Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the Welsh language](#)

such as the Urdd, the Royal Welsh and the Eisteddfod are proactively supported in their work following severe economic losses due to the pandemic.

The next committee should inquire about the impact on the community use of the Welsh language as a result of the pandemic.

8. Future committee remit

68. In January 2021, the Committee wrote to stakeholders to ask:

- What lessons can be learned from the experience of the Committee and its scrutiny of the portfolio in advance of the Sixth Senedd?
- What have been the strengths and weaknesses of the Committee's remit including whether it enabled the Committee to work effectively?
- Do you and your organisation have a view on the Committee's ways of working? Are there any new ways of working that could be adopted in future? You may wish to consider its approach to evidence-gathering, scrutiny of the Welsh Government, and new virtual ways of working.

69. Those who responded, were in favour of establishing a committee with a similar remit in the Sixth Senedd. For instance, Efa Gruffudd Jones, from The National Centre for Learning Welsh, said:

“My main word of advice for the next Senedd would be that continuing to have a committee that gives due attention to policy issues related to the Welsh language is vital, and that the very existence of the committee itself has enhanced the status of this policy area.”²⁷

70. Both Dathlu'r Gymraeg and the Welsh Language Commissioner argued that the Sixth Senedd Committee should scrutinise Welsh language issues across a greater range of organisations and Welsh Government portfolios. The Commissioner said:

“Welsh language in the health and care sector is just one example of this, with a real need to scrutinize how the implementation of strategies and legislation in the field affect opportunities to use the Welsh language.”²⁸

71. Members asked the Minister for Mental Health, Wellbeing and Welsh Language if she would be supportive of a successor committee with the Welsh language as a central part of its remit. The Minister said:

²⁷ The National Centre for Learning Welsh written response

²⁸ Welsh Language Commissioner written response

“I think it’s really helpful to me as a Minister in relation to the Welsh language... I would suggest that actually, rather than just holding me to account when it comes to the budget, and looking at my tiny budget... that actually you ask the other Ministers, who’ve got huge amounts of money, what they’re doing within their budgets in relation to the Welsh language.”²⁹

72. The Institute for Welsh Affairs called for a committee to look into media and democracy in Wales in their 2015 Media Audit. Commenting on the continuing need to ‘highlight the democratic deficit Wales faces as a result of an increasingly under-resourced media’, it said:

“We believe that the Sixth Senedd must retain a committee with a remit to focus on broadcasting and news in Wales, and that sitting these issues within a remit to look at the health of the wider creative economy remains a wise approach.”³⁰

73. ITV Cymru Wales endorsed the committee’s current remit and outlined the value it had in raising the profile of issues facing public service broadcasters. Phil Henfrey said:

“I would say that the committee’s remit has certainly allowed us to discuss not just our Channel 3 licensed service but also the work we are doing across our growing production businesses, our network output - featuring programming that celebrates the best of Wales before an all-UK audience - and our increasingly important online and social media platforms. On that basis it seems very much fit for purpose.”³¹

74. This is only the second time in the Senedd’s history that the Welsh language, has been included in the title of a committee, and the first time ‘communications’ has had this prominence. By highlighting the importance of these topics the committee has raised the profile of issues such as journalism and broadcasting. This has resulted in policy recommendations which seek to address the urgency of changes in these fields.

75. The Committee wants to ensure that these gains are built on, not lost in the next Senedd.

²⁹ CWLC Committee, 25 February 2021, para 137

³⁰ Institute for Welsh Affairs written response

³¹ ITV Cymru Wales written response

Suggested remit of a successor committee in the Sixth Senedd:

Members of the Sixth Senedd should convene a committee to scrutinise culture, the Welsh language and communications which would fulfil a valuable role in focussing on:

- the needs of Welsh local media and broadcasting;
- the delivery of the Welsh Government's ambition for increasing the number of Welsh speakers; and
- the work to expand access to heritage, the arts and creative industries and ensure the sector is supported following the losses from the pandemic.

The committee should seek opportunities to carry out joint scrutiny/inquiries with other committees. For instance, with the committee scrutinising the economy to look at creative industries.

9. Annex: Legislation referred to the Committee

76. The Committee scrutinised three sets of Welsh language regulations during this Senedd. They were:

- The Welsh Language Standards (No. 6) Regulations 2017;
- The Welsh Language Standards (No.7) Regulations 2018;
- National Health Service (Welsh Language in Primary Care Services) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2019.

77. The 2017 regulations applied to organisations in the higher and further education sector and the 2018 regulations applied to organisations in the health sector. They specified service delivery standards, policy making standards, operational standards and record keeping standards. They also enabled the Welsh Language Commissioner to issue Compliance Notices to the organisations named in the regulations, in relation to the standards specified. The 2019 regulations placed duties relating to the Welsh language, on independent primary care providers in Wales through the terms of their agreements with Local Health Boards.

78. The Committee was critical of the Welsh Government's failure to involve the Committee earlier in the consultation process on the first two sets of regulations. For instance, the regulations on duties for primary care providers were introduced via the Senedd's Negative Resolution procedure and the timing in June 2019 meant that the Committee had just ten working days to scrutinise and report on them.

79. Following this, the draft Welsh Language Standards (No.8) Regulations for healthcare regulators and the Professional Standards Authority were shared with the Committee when they were issued for consultation in May 2020. The Minister for Mental Health, Wellbeing and Welsh Language wrote to the Committee in January 2021 to say that they 'will not be brought forward in this Senedd term'.

Annex: Work of the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee

Arts and culture	
Committee's findings on the Independent Review of Support for Publishing and Literature in Wales	March 2018
Building resilience: inquiry into non-public funding of the arts	March 2018
Hitting the right note: inquiry into funding for and access to music education	June 2018
Inquiry into film and major television production in Wales	May 2019
Count me in! Tackling poverty and social exclusion through culture, heritage and the arts	November 2019
Turn up the volume: inquiry into the live music industry	December 2020
Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the arts	June 2020
Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the creative industries	July 2020
Welsh Language	
Achieving the ambition: inquiry into the Welsh Government's new Welsh language strategy report	May 2017
Report on supporting and promoting the Welsh language	July 2019
Teaching of Welsh history report	November 2019
Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the Welsh language	December 2020
Annual scrutiny of the Welsh Language Commissioner	
Communications	
The Big Picture: the Committee's initial views on broadcasting in Wales	February 2017
Outside the box: the future of S4C	August 2017
Read all about it: Inquiry into news journalism in Wales	May 2018
Tuning in: inquiry into radio in Wales	December 2018
A short report into community radio in Wales	November 2019
Devolution of Broadcasting	March 2021

Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on journalism and local media	September 2020
Annual scrutiny of public sector broadcasters – ITV, BBC and S4C	
Heritage	
Past and Present – Report of an Inquiry into the Historic Environment	March 2018
Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on heritage, museums and archives	August 2020
Set in Stone? A report on who gets remembered in public spaces	March 2021
Sport	
Short report on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on sport	June 2020
Scrutiny	
Brexit, the arts sector, creative industries, heritage and the Welsh language	December 2018

Annex: Written consultation responses

All responses have been published on the Committee's website:

[Fifth Senedd Legacy - Culture, Welsh Language and Communications](#)

Reference	Organisation
LEG01	Dyfodol i'r Iaith Gymraeg
LEG02	The Welsh Language Society
LEG03	ITV Cymru Wales
LEG04	University of South Wales
LEG05	WLGA
LEG06	NEU Cymru
LEG07	Institute of Welsh Affairs
LEG08	Dathlu'r Gymraeg
LEG09	National Centre for Learning Welsh
LEG10	National Museum Wales
LEG11	Welsh Language Commissioner
LEG12	National Union of Journalists
LEG13	Wales YFC
LEG14	Disability Can Do
LEG15	Cadw